



City of Santa Clara

HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, January 9, 2014 – 7:00 P.M.
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1505 Warburton Avenue
Santa Clara, CA 95050

Please refer to the Historical and Landmarks Commission Procedural Items guideline for information on all procedural matters.
An audio recording of this meeting is available in the Planning Office for review or purchase the Friday following the meeting.

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

The following items from this Historical and Landmarks Commission agenda will be scheduled for Council review following the conclusion of hearings and recommendations by the Historical and Landmarks Commission. Due to timing of notices for Council hearings and the preparation of Council agenda reports, these items will not necessarily be heard on the date the minutes from this meeting are forwarded to the Council. Please contact the Planning Division office for information on the schedule of hearings for these items:

- **None**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 7:03 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Chair Brian Johns, Michael Hyams, Robert Luckinbill, Jeannie Mahan, and J.L. "Spike" Standifer

Commissioner Excused: Kris Motyka and Jerry McKee

Staff Present: Yen Chen, Associate Planner, Payal Bhagat, Assistant Planner II (Item 8.B.)

3. DISTRIBUTION OF AGENDA AND STAFF REPORTS

Copies of current agendas and staff reports for each of the items on the agenda are available from the Planning Division office on the Friday afternoon preceding the meeting and are available at the Commission meeting at the time of the hearing. Chair Johns reviewed this procedure.

4. DECLARATION OF COMMISSION PROCEDURES

Chair Johns reviewed the Historical and Landmarks Commission procedures for those present.

5. REQUESTS FOR EXCEPTIONS, WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

- A. Withdrawals – None
- B. Continuances - None
- C. Exceptions - None

6. ORAL PETITIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

- Ms. Sarah Doty requested to be placed on a future agenda. She plans to brief the Commission on her research of clerk records on the role of the Commission.

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

Consent Calendar items may be enacted, approved or adopted, based upon the findings prepared and provided in the written staff report, by one motion unless requested to be removed by anyone for discussion or explanation. If any member of the Historical and Landmarks Commission, staff, the applicant or a member of the public wishes to comment on a Consent Calendar item, or would like the item to be heard on the regular agenda, please notify Planning staff, or request this action at the Historical and Landmarks Commission meeting when the Chair calls for these requests during the Consent Calendar review.

7.A. Approval of Historical and Landmarks Commission Minutes for the meeting of December 4, 2013.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner Mahan and was carried (5-0-0-2) to approve the Minutes of December 4, 2013

*****END OF CONSENT CALENDAR*****

8. PUBLIC MEETNG ITEMS

8.A.	File No.(s):	PLN2013-10069
	Location:	500 El Camino Real, Building 109, Santa Clara University Nobili Hall, between Mayer Theater and Adobe Lodge, directly behind the Mission Church; APN: 269-23-073; property is zoned Public, Quasi-public, and Public Park or Recreation Zoning District (B)
	Applicant/Owner:	Joe Sugg, Santa Clara University
	Request:	Design Review of a lobby expansion in Nobili Hall; the project includes renovation of the interior stairway
	CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation
	Project Planner:	Debby Fernandez, Associate Planner
	Staff Recommendation:	Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for these items was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Chen gave a brief presentation of the project. On November 7, 2013, Commission reviewed the proposal. Following public comment and discussion, the Commission requested additional information from the University to assist in evaluating the proposal and continued the project.

Mr. Salvatore Caruso, AIA, representing Santa Clara University, provided photographs of the stairs. He noted that the proposal is to modify the entry to accommodate accessibility and safety. The proposal entails moving the newel post back three feet to create a foyer. The public comment period was open and closed with no public comment.

The Commission inquired about the recommended Findings of Effect Report and impact on future designation as a State or National resource. Mr. Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC, noted the applicant, by clarifying the proposal to use Historic Building Code and to keep and reuse the existing stairwell, results in a minor alteration. Mr. Mineweaser also noted that, providing documentation on the change will assist in the future if the applicant was to apply for State or National designated resource.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner Hyams and was carried (5-0-0-2, Motyka and McKee absent), to recommend approval of the project, subject to using the Historic Building code and reuse of the stair well materials.

8.B. File No.(s): **PLN2013-10117**
Location: 1277 Lafayette Street, a 6,500 square foot site located approximately fifty feet south east from the intersection of Harrison Street and Lafayette Street; APN: 269-16-063; Property is zoned Single-Family (R1-6L)
Applicant/Owner: Salvatore Caruso/Eugene Korsunsky
Request: **Design Review** of a 375 square foot addition to the main structure and construction of a 639 square foot dwelling unit above a new two car garage in the rear yard
CEQA Determination: Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15303, New Construction
Project Planner: Payal Bhagat, Assistant Planner II
Staff Recommendation: **Recommend Approval, subject to conditions**

Notice: The notice of public meeting for these items was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Ms. Bhagat gave a brief presentation of the project. The Commission reviewed a letter in opposition to the proposed change to Planned Development zoning from Shirley Odou dated January 9, 2014. Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC commented that a variance is a better application process for these types of projects. He commented that the addition to the rear of the residence is not visible. He also noted that impacts to the streetscape are limited since the two story unit above the garage is located at the back of the lot. Mr. Sal Caruso explained that the Planning Application for a rezone to Planned Development is necessary due to the limitations of the Single Family zoning district. Mr. Caruso presented photos of the existing residence and noted that the existing large fig tree in the back yard will be replaced with a medium size tree.

The public comment period was opened. Ms. Judy Tucker commented that parking is limited on Lafayette Street. She noted concerns over the number of bedrooms proposed and the possible use of the property as student housing. Ms. Sarah Doty noted that backing out on Lafayette Street is dangerous. The public comment period was closed.

Commissioner Mahan noted the proposed intensification of the lot and the possible use of the student housing will have an impact to the surrounding properties. She noted her concerns over parking impacts upon the neighborhood. Commissioner Standifer concurred and noted the need to preserve the Old Quad. Commissioner Hyams discussed the efforts to protect the single family residential neighborhood in the Old Quad and commented on City policies adopted with GP Amendment #34 back in 1994. Commissioner Luckinbill stated that he was concerned with parking, however, the matter should be addressed by the Planning Commission and City Council. Commissioner Johns noted concerns over the use of the Planned Development instead of pursuing the proposal as a variance application. He then noted that under a variance application the project might not be supported.

The Commission discussed the concerns over parking, number of bedrooms and student housing. Mr. Sal Caruso noted that cars can turn around on the lot and there is no need to back out onto Lafayette Street.

The Commission re-opened the public comment period. Ms. Judy Tucker noted concerns over the amount of hardscape being proposed. She has seen in the Old Quad reduction of open space in back yards. Ms. Sarah Doty spoke on the need to be sensitive to Old Quad residents that have decided to maintain the use of properties single family residences. She also noted her concerns over possible parking impacts to surrounding neighborhood. Mr. James Rowen commented Santa Clara University is the oldest resident in the Old Quad. He commented that houses should be allowed to build taller and larger where there are no impacts to surrounding properties. Mr. Sal Caruso responded that the concrete surface area is less than 50% of the improved area and referred to drawings. The public comment period was closed.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner Hyams and was carried (5-0-0-2, Motyka and McKee absent) to recommend approval of the addition to the rear of the main house.

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner Johns and was carried (4-1-0-2, Standifer opposed, Motyka and McKee absent) to recommend approval of the addition to the rear of the main house and construction of the two car garage.

It was moved by Commissioner Johns, seconded by Commissioner Hyams and was lost (2-3-0-2, Johns and Luckinbill in favor, Hyams, Mahan and Standifer opposed, Motyka and McKee absent) to recommend approval of the addition to the rear of the main house, construction of the dwelling unit above the new two car garage.

8.C.	File No.(s):	PLN2013-10087
	Location:	1545 Newhall Street, a 6,753 sf. parcel located on the north side of Newhall Street, approximately 300 feet east of Alviso Street; APN: 269-52-091; property is zoned Single-Family (R1-6L)
	Applicant/Owner:	Don M. Hare, Brandon M. Hare
	Request:	Design Review of a new 550 square foot detached accessory structure addition to a single-story home; the property is located within 100 feet of a historic resource
	CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15301, Existing Facilities
	Project Planner:	Steve Le, Planning Intern
	Staff Recommendation:	Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for these items was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Chen gave a brief presentation of the project. Mr. Brandon Hare commented that the project will convert the existing two-car garage to living space and construct a new garage at the rear of the property with access to Kaiser Alley. The public comment period was opened. Ms. Judy Tucker commented on the oversized garage and inquired about its relationship to the lot size. The public comment period was closed.

The Commission noted that similar size structures and garage uses line the alley. Mr. Chen noted that other properties that face Newhall Street also have access from Kaiser Alley.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Hyams, seconded by Commissioner Mahan and was carried (5-0-0-2, Motyka and McKee absent), to recommend approval of the project.

9. OTHER BUSINESS

9.A. Commission Procedures and Staff Communications

i. Announcements/Other Items

- Request from Sarah Doty – Re: 1077 Harrison Street / “Harrison Street Block”
- Ms. Sarah Doty noted that December 3, 1981 the HLC supported National listing of the property. She noted at that time, even with the HABS report, not all the homeowners on Harrison Street supported listing.
- Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC noted that the body of record for a nomination is extensive.
- Mr. James Rowen commented that the item was not properly noticed or listed correctly on the agenda. He was concerned that this was a Brown Act violation. He also commented the entirety of the Harrison Street Block should be informed and part of the request. He noted piece meal consideration of the project is not appropriate.
- The Commission noted that the effort to obtain listing is a good idea.
- Mr. Chen noted that a formal request would be referred to the City once an application is completed with the State Historic Preservation Office.
- It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner Hyams and was carried (5-0-0-2, Motyka and McKee absent), that formal reviews received by the City for National or State listings be placed on the HLC agenda review and comment.
- Email from Judy Tucker – Re: HLC meeting 12/5/13
- Chair Johns noted receiving the complimentary email from Ms. Tucker.
- California’s Statewide Historic Preservation Plan 2013-2017 (verbal update)
- Mr. Chen noted the full plan is on-line and the handout is the executive summary.
- Update on Morse Mansion (verbal update)
- Mr. Chen provided an update on the Morse Mansion. He noted that the resolution on the removal of trees and landscaping is being pursued by the Planning staff.
- Zoning Ordinance Update (verbal update)
- Mr. Chen noted that outside consultants will be assisting the Planning staff with the update to the zoning ordinance.
- Monthly Report on HT properties: Residential reversions (verbal update)
- None.
- Annual report on matter of document retention (verbal update)
- No items to report.

ii. Report of the Liaison from the Planning and Inspection Department

- City Council and Planning Commission Actions (verbal update)
- Mr. Chen gave a brief overview of items before the City Council and Planning Commission.

iii. Commission/Board Liaison and Committee Reports

- Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee / Standifer as alternate)
[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headen-Inman House]
- Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Mahan / Luckinbill as alternate)
[Second Friday of each month at 10:00 a.m. - Harris Lass Preserve]
- Commissioner Mahan noted that 818 tickets were sold. Generating a profit of approximately \$12,000 of which \$6,000 goes to Harris Lass and the other funds will be for senior services, fire and railroad museum.
- Old Quad Residents Association (Motyka / Hyams as alternate)
- Commissioner Hyams noted that 20 people were in attendance at the December 14th meeting. The purpose of the meeting was to find out the interest of the members, create a mission statement. Next meeting is set for mid-January to determine how to broaden membership.
- Architectural Committee (Mahan / Johns as alternate)
- Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Standifer / Luckinbill as alternate)

- BART/ High Speed Rail/ VTA BRT Committee (Johns / McKee as alternate)
- Zoning Ordinance Update (Motyka / Johns as Alternate)
- Preservation Ordinance Ad-hoc Committee (Motyka and Mahan / Luckinbill and McKee as alternate)
- The Committee is progressing forward with the use of the Santa Clara County as a basis for the preservation ordinance.
- Sesquicentennial Railroad Depot Celebration (Mahan / Johns as alternate)
- The event is on January 18 from 11:00am to 3:00pm. The Commission will have a table inside the depot.

iv. Commission Activities

- Commissioner Travel and Training Reports

v. Upcoming Agenda Items

- Technical Review of Resources for Maywood Tract – March 2014
- Tour of the City's Mackay neighborhoods (Yen Chen) - TBD
- Franklin Post Office Update (Lorie Garcia) – TBD
- Review of Street Name List (Lorie Garcia) – TBD
- Office of Historic Preservation – eLearning Training (Yen Chen) - TBD

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:38 p.m. The next regular Historical and Landmarks Commission meeting will be held on Thursday, February 6, 2014 at 7:00 p.m. in the City Council Chambers.

Prepared by: 
 Yen Chen
 Associate Planner

Approved: 
 Gloria Sciara, AICP
 Development Review Officer

I:\PLANNING\2014\HLC 2014\01.09.2014\HLC Minutes 01.09.14.doc